UNITED NATIONS





General Assembly

Distr. GENERAL

A/HRC/12/23 13 July 2009

ENGLISH

Original: FRENCH

HUMAN RIGHTS COUNCIL Twelfth session Agenda item 3

PROMOTION AND PROTECTION OF ALL HUMAN RIGHTS, CIVIL, POLITICAL, ECONOMIC, SOCIAL AND CULTURAL RIGHTS, INCLUDING THE RIGHT TO DEVELOPMENT

Report of the Special Rapporteur on the sale of children, child prostitution and child pornography, Najat M'jid Maalla*

^{*} Late submission.

Summary

Child pornography on the Internet constitutes a worldwide problem: the development of new technologies which greatly increase ways of accessing, disseminating and selling this criminal material has contributed to the growth of this phenomenon.

Numerous actors from both the private and public sectors have made a commitment and worked actively to combat child pornography, leading to the implementation of many measures: legislative reforms, dismantling of networks, exposure reporting services for Internet users, filtering and blocking of Internet sites, seizures of pornographic material, arrests, awareness campaigns, etc.

However, despite these many and varied initiatives there is more and more child pornography on the Internet, becoming what is today a very profitable business, with a worldwide market value estimated at billions of dollars.

In the context of monitoring implementation of the recommendations made by the previous Special Rapporteur in 2005, and of follow-up to the Third World Congress against Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children and Adolescents, held in Rio de Janeiro, and to the recommendations of the United Nations Study on Violence Against Children (A/61/299) and the recommendations of the Committee on the Rights of the Child, the present report is intended to take stock of progress made, identify remaining challenges and make specific recommendations on how better to prevent and combat child pornography on the Internet.

Given the seriousness of the crime, the Special Rapporteur is of the opinion that relevant legislation should be clear and comprehensive and treat child pornography on the Internet as a grave violation of the rights of the child and as a criminal act. The age of consent to sexual activity should not be a relevant factor because a minor under the age of 18 is not in a position to consent to sexual exploitation, such as child pornography, all forms of which should be criminalized and heavily penalized. The victim's privacy must be protected and appropriate protection measures and care adapted to the needs and characteristics of children must be available.

Actions undertaken should be specific and targeted and guarantee specialized resources for the identification of victims, adequate protection for child victims and child Internet users, genuine involvement of children, a committed and responsible private sector, and, lastly, coordinated, effective and structured international cooperation for the protection of all children everywhere in the world, because, it let us forget, countries have no borders where Internet use is concerned, which is a great help to sexual predators.

CONTENTS

			Paragraphs	Page
I.	W	ORKING METHODS AND ACTIVITIES	1 - 11	4
	A.	Working methods	1 - 4	4
	B.	Activities	5 - 11	4
II.	СН	ILD PORNOGRAPHY ON THE INTERNET	12-121	5
	A.	Introduction	14 - 17	6
	B.	Definitions	18 - 32	7
	C.	Scope and forms	33 - 52	8
	D.	Legislative framework	53 - 71	12
	E.	Existing measures	72 - 109	14
	F.	International cooperation	110 - 121	21
III.	CO	NCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	122 - 124	22

I. WORKING METHODS AND ACTIVITIES

A. Working methods

- 1. In its resolution 7/13 the Human Rights Council requested the Special Rapporteur to submit a report on the implementation of her mandate to the Council in accordance with its annual programme of work. The present report is submitted in response to that request.
- 2. This report focuses on child pornography on the Internet. It is based on information submitted to the Special Rapporteur through a questionnaire sent to Governments, international organizations, non-governmental organizations (NGOs) and the private sector in March 2009, as well as on other research undertaken by the Special Rapporteur.
- 3. In the questionnaire the Special Rapporteur requested information on the scope and forms of child pornography, existing legislation and initiatives to prevent and combat child pornography on the Internet.
- 4. The Special Rapporteur would like to thank warmly all those who responded. Only a selection of the wealth of experiences and initiatives on which information was received is outlined in this report.

B. Activities

1. Country visits

- 5. Since her previous report to the Council (A/HRC/9/21) the Special Rapporteur undertook visits to Estonia, from 18-24 October 2008, and Latvia, from 25-31 October 2008. The reports on these visits are presented as addenda to this report (A/HRC/12/23/Add.1 and Add.2).
- 6. Since her previous report the Special Rapporteur has requested invitations to visit the following States: Egypt, the Gambia, India, Mauritius, Nigeria, Oman, Senegal, United Arab Emirates and the United States of America. Positive responses were received from Oman, Senegal and the United Arab Emirates.

2. Conferences, seminars and contacts with civil society

7. Since September 2008 the Special Rapporteur has participated in several conferences and seminars. In November 2008 she attended the Third World Congress against Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children and Adolescents, in Rio de Janeiro, Brazil, during which she participated in the high-level panel on the various forms of commercial sexual exploitation and new trends in that regard, as well as in several workshops dealing with: (a) the Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on the sale of children, child prostitution and child pornography; (b) the sexual exploitation of children; and (c) child mobility.

- 8. On 9 and 10 March 2009 the Special Rapporteur attended the International Girl Child Conference on violence against girls in The Hague, Netherlands, a follow-up activity to the United Nations Study on Violence Against Children. In April 2009 the Special Rapporteur became a member of a scientific committee for the preparation of a conference on child mobility to be held in October 2009 and participated in the first meeting of that committee, in Barcelona, organized by Save the Children UK.
- 9. In May 2009 the Special Rapporteur addressed the International Conference on Effective Strategies for the Prevention of Child Online Pornography, Trafficking and Abuse, held in Manama, Bahrain. She met a number of stakeholders and had an opportunity to gather information for the thematic part of the present report. In May she also participated in a working meeting of the International Bureau for Children's Rights (IBCR), held in Montreal, on implementation of the Guidelines on Justice in Matters involving Child Victims and Witnesses of Crime (Economic and Social Council resolution 2005/20).
- 10. At the end of June 2009 the Special Rapporteur, in accordance with the intention expressed in her first report (A/HRC/9/21, paragraph 45 and passim), and in cooperation with the Special Rapporteur on trafficking in persons, especially women and children, and the Special Rapporteur on contemporary forms of slavery, organized a seminar to discuss the working methods of their three mandates and develop practical modalities for cooperation between the three mandate holders and United Nations institutions and agencies, NGOs and other mechanisms working in the human rights field. By way of conclusion, the participants drafted a plan of action setting out the tasks to be accomplished and a programme of work. Those tasks included the creation of a ListServer to facilitate regular exchange of information and the creation of a webpage containing information on the three mandates, NGOs, United Nations agencies and human rights mechanisms dealing with issues pertinent to the three mandates.

3. Communications

11. Between 1 December 2007 and 30 April 2009 the Special Rapporteur sent letters concerning allegations to six Governments and received two responses. A summary of the letters sent and the responses received is contained in addendum 3 to this report (A/HRC/12/23/Add.3).

II. CHILD PORNOGRAPHY ON THE INTERNET

12. The Special Rapporteur would like to thank the following countries for responding to the questionnaire: Algeria, Argentina, Australia, Azerbaijan, Belarus, Costa Rica, Cyprus, Egypt, El Salvador, Finland, Germany, Greece, Guatemala, Indonesia, Iraq, Ireland, Italy, Japan, Kazakhstan, Lebanon, Liechtenstein, Madagascar, Mauritius, Mexico, Morocco, Monaco, Nepal, Oman, Pakistan, Peru, Poland, Portugal, Qatar, Republic of Moldova, Romania, Russian Federation, Samoa, Serbia, Singapore, Slovakia, Slovenia, Spain, Switzerland, Suriname, Thailand, Tunisia, Turkmenistan, Ukraine, United Arab Emirates, United States of America, Uruguay, Uzbekistan and Venezuela (Bolivarian Republic of).

¹ See http://www.girlchildconference.com/.

13. The Special Rapporteur would also like to thank the following for their valuable contribution: the International Criminal Police Organization (INTERPOL); Internet service providers and credit card companies, for example Google, VISA Europe and PayPal; and NGOs National Centre for Missing and Exploited Children (NCMEC), End Child Prostitution, Child Pornography and Trafficking of Children for Sexual Purposes (ECPAT) and Internet Watch Foundation (IWF), which submitted information on the issue in general or with regard to specific countries: the Netherlands, South Africa, Spain, Taiwan, the United States of America and the United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland.

A. Introduction

- 14. Child pornography on the Internet constitutes a worldwide problem: the development of new technologies which greatly increase ways of accessing, disseminating and selling this criminal material has contributed to the growth of this phenomenon. New technologies considerably increase the opportunities available to predators by allowing them to stalk, recruit and exploit children anywhere in the world. The United Nations Children's Fund (UNICEF) estimates that there are more than 4 million sites featuring victims who are young minors, including even children under 2. Predators can stalk new victims anonymously in chat rooms and blogs.
- 15. The commitment and efforts of many actors (international community, public authorities; NGOs; the private sector, in particular Internet Service Providers (ISPs) and the telecommunications sector; credit card issuers, etc.) have led to the implementation of many measures: legislative reforms, dismantling of child pornography networks, exposure reporting facilities for Internet users, filtering and blocking of Internet sites, seizures of pornographic material, arrests, awareness-raising campaigns, etc.).
- 16. However, despite these many and varied initiatives, there is more and more child pornography on the Internet, becoming what is today a very profitable business with a worldwide market value estimated to be in billions of dollars. Easy access to new technologies, constant changes in production methods and consumption patterns, in addition to the international dimension of child pornography, complicate the fight against this scourge in both the developed and developing countries. Child pornography continues to be a very topical and alarming issue.
- 17. This report has been drafted in the context of monitoring implementation of the recommendations made by the previous Special Rapporteur, Juan Miguel Petit, in 2005; to follow up to the Third World Congress against Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children and Adolescents, held in Rio de Janeiro in 2008; and to follow-up to the recommendations of the United Nations Study on Violence Against Children and the recommendations of the Committee on the Rights of the Child. It is intended to take stock of progress made, identify remaining challenges and make specific recommendations with a view better to prevent and combat child pornography on the Internet.

B. Definitions

1. What do we mean by child pornography?

- 18. Many terms are used to describe child pornography: paedo-pornography, paedophilia, infant pornography, juvenile pornography, pseudo-infant pornography, simulated pornography, virtual pornography, online sexual abuse and pornography, child erotica, etc.
- 19. Child pornography on the Internet is a type of sexual exploitation of children that takes many forms, depicting a child engaged in real or simulated explicit sexual activities or lewdly depicting parts of a child's body, with the intention of stimulating sexual arousal and gratification. There may be one or several children, involved in sexual acts alone or with other children, with or without the participation of adults, who may or may not be visible. There may be highly repugnant images involving brutal anal or vaginal rape, bondage, zoophilia, oral-genital sexual relations or other degrading behaviour involving children of any age.
- 20. Child erotica consists of images of children posing half-dressed/naked or naked with the emphasis on sexualizing the child.
- 21. Virtual pornography is the production on the Internet of morphed or blended artificially created images of children involved in sexual activities. The realism of such images creates the illusion that children are actually involved.
- 22. In pseudo-infantile pornography or initiation pornography the models are recorded or photographed in child-like poses, staged with props to reinforce the impression of youth.

2. Definitions in international instruments

- 23. The Convention on the Rights of the Child defines a child as every human being below the age of 18 years unless under the law applicable to the child, majority is attained earlier. Pursuant to article 34 of the Convention, States parties undertake to protect the child from all forms of sexual exploitation and sexual abuse. For these purposes, States parties shall in particular take all appropriate national, bilateral and multilateral measures to prevent "the exploitative use of children in pornographic performances and materials" (art. 34 (c)).
- 24. The Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on the sale of children, child prostitution and child pornography defines child pornography as any representation, by whatever means, of a child engaged in real or simulated explicit sexual activities or any representation of the sexual parts of a child for primarily sexual purposes (art. 2 (c)). The Optional Protocol has been ratified by 131 States, and the Committee on the Rights of the Child has urged the States parties and the international community to take whatever steps are required in order to prevent the distribution and dissemination of child pornography on the Internet.
- 25. Pursuant to article 3, paragraph 1 (c) of the Optional Protocol, each State party shall ensure that producing, distributing, disseminating, importing, exporting, offering, selling or possessing for the above purposes child pornography are fully covered under its criminal or penal law, whether such offences are committed domestically or transnationally or on an individual or organized basis.

- 26. In addition, States parties may undertake any action or adopt any measure necessary to ensure full protection of children. The Committee on the Rights of the Child likewise encourages them to prohibit mere possession of child pornography.
- 27. Under article 3 (b) of International Labour Organization (ILO) Convention No. 182 (1999) concerning the Prohibition and Immediate Action for the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour, the use, procuring or offering of a child for prostitution, for the production of pornography or for pornographic performances is included among the worst forms of child labour.
- 28. The Council of Europe Convention on Cybercrime (CETS No. 185), which entered into force in 2004 and is open for signature by member States and by non-member States which participated in its elaboration, and for accession by other non-member States, deals with crimes committed and information transmitted via computer networks. Article 9, paragraph 2 (a), of the Convention states that child pornography shall include pornographic material that visually depicts a minor engaged in sexually explicit conduct. The same article defines the term "minor" as including all persons under 18 years of age (para. 3).
- 29. The term "sexually explicit conduct" covers not only images depicting children engaged in sexual activities with other children or with adults, or hard-core pornography, but also lewdly depicting naked children with an emphasis on sexualizing the child (soft-core pornography).
- 30. Pursuant to the Convention on Cybercrime, material that visually depicts "a person appearing to be a minor engaged in sexually explicit conduct" (art. 9, para. 2 (b)) is likewise considered to be child pornography and, therefore, to be illegal.
- 31. Finally, the Convention on Cybercrime considers "realistic images" representing a minor engaged in sexually explicit conduct (art. 9, para. 2 (c)) as also falling within the category of child pornography. The term realistic images means photographs prepared and manipulated using computer-based techniques with a view to replacing images of adults with images of children, a process known as "morphing". Even if such images are artificially created they appear real and therefore have the same effect on the person viewing them.
- 32. The Council of Europe Convention on the Protection of Children against Sexual Exploitation and Sexual Abuse (CETS No. 201), adopted in 2007 at the 28th Conference of European Ministers of Justice, held in Lanzarote, Spain, but not yet in force, defines "child pornography" as any material that visually depicts a child engaged in real or simulated sexually explicit conduct or any depiction of a child's sexual organs for primarily sexual purposes. The Convention also contains a provision prohibiting the solicitation of children for sexual purposes (also known as "grooming" using information technologies).

C. Scope and forms

33. The significant resources allocated by certain States (often the most industrialized) in collaboration with NGOs and ISPs and, above all, international partners have provided data on child pornography on the Internet which, while not reflecting the full scale of the phenomenon,

show that to be a growing one. One must wonder, however, if that growth is real or whether the bottom of the iceberg has simply been revealed. Do the data indicate a new upsurge in child pornography networks or has data-gathering simply improved because the authorities are more concerned with that phenomenon and allocating increased resources to combating it? Or is it a combination of both?

- 34. The number of sites devoted to child pornography worldwide is growing: 480,000 identified in 2004 compared to 261,653 in 2001. The number of predators connected to the Internet at any one time is estimated to be 750,000.
- 35. As of 19 April 2009, the National Centre on Missing and Exploited Children (NCMEC) in the United States, had since its creation in 1998, identified 592,044 out of a total of 681,275 sites as child pornography sites. In 2007 the Internet Watch Foundation (IWF) in the United Kingdom received 34,871 reports, including 2,755 domains containing images of sexual abuse of children (80 per cent for commercial purposes and 20 per cent non-commercial); in 2008 it received 33,947 reports including 1,536 domains depicting sexual abuse of children (74 per cent for commercial purposes and 26 per cent for non-commercial storing or exchange).
- 36. Thousands of new photographs and videos are uploaded on to the Internet every week and hundreds of thousands of searches for images of sexual exploitation of children are carried out every day. Offenders may possess collections of over a million images of sexually exploited children. It is estimated that 200 new images are put into circulation every day.
- 37. Since child pornography is illegal, it is difficult to estimate the number of minors worldwide who are victims of these networks; estimates range from 10,000 to 100,000. Children of all ages, including babies, are exploited for pornographic purposes across the world. According to an American study, 83 per cent of individuals possessing child pornography material had images of children between the ages of 6 and 12; 39 per cent had images of children between the ages of 3 and 5; 19 per cent had images of babies and infants under the age of 3; and 87 per cent of perpetrators had very explicit images of prepubescent children.²
- 38. Images of sexually exploited children are not only growing in number but are also increasingly shocking. "The children in the images ... are suffering some of the cruellest forms of sexual abuse and ..., increasingly, appear to be younger." The number of images "of serious child exploitation" quadrupled between 2003 and 2007 and 47 per cent of the websites assessed depicted grave child sexual abuse images in the most severe categories at levels 4 and 5. The number of domains identified as containing indecent images dropped in fact from 2007 to 2008 but there is no data on the number of sites containing serious forms of child pornography.

Information supplied by NCMEC for the preparation of this report, 2009.

³ IWF annual report 2007, page 8. (http://www.iwf.org.uk/documents/20080417_iwf_annual_report_2007_(web).pdf).

- 39. According to an American study, 92 per cent of offenders were in possession of images of minors that emphasized their sexuality or images of minors involved in explicit sexual activities; 80 per cent of the images depicted anal penetration of a child, including oral sex, and 21 per cent had child pornography material depicting violent scenes, including rape, bondage and torture of children.
- 40. An Australian Federal Police study on sexual predators on the Internet yielded the following statistics:

Activity	Number	Percentage
Incest or implicit incest	16	32 per cent
Torture, violence, bondage, etc.	13	26 per cent
Humiliating or degrading activities (use of urine,	9	18 per cent
excrement, etc.)		
Zoophilia	9	18 per cent

- 41. Most producers of images of sexually exploited children are known to their victims: 37 per cent of offenders are family members, 36 per cent acquaintances; more than 30 per cent of individuals found guilty of possessing child pornography lived with minors and more than 50 per cent of those individuals had access to minors at home, at work or in their social environment. Furthermore, abusers had known the child for a long time before initiating sexual activity: in 39.1 per cent of cases the first sexual contact occurred more than one year after initial contact.
- 42. There are many types of users of child pornography sites: consumers, producers, distributors, abusers, paedophiles, etc. While a person who visits child pornography sites is not necessarily a potential child abuser, it should be emphasized that statistically speaking most predators arrested for molesting or raping children were in possession of significant collections of child pornography.
- 43. Child pornography is either produced offline for subsequent circulation on the Internet or live for online viewers. The exact number of images in circulation is difficult to determine, given the availability of child pornography on peer-to-peer (P2P) networks (social networking).
- 44. The production and distribution of criminal child pornography depicting abuse of children has an estimated value of between \$3 billion and \$20 billion.
- 45. There has also been a significant increase in Internet solicitation of children for sexual purposes. According to the Pew Research Center, 60 per cent of adolescents have received messages from strangers, not always of a sexual nature, and one child in four found this normal. Likewise, according to the FBI, the number of online assaults on children increases by

⁴ NCMEC contribution to this report, 2009.

10 per cent every year. ⁵ Chat rooms have become one of the main means of luring minors into participating in pornographic films, having sexual relations and even of abducting them. Internet users have various strategies for approaching children: seduction, blackmail, etc.

- 46. In chat rooms sexual predators looking for a child can exploit the anonymity of the chat in order to seduce the child. By posing as adolescents themselves, they persuade the child to continue contact by e-mail. After a few "innocent" conversations, they gain the child's confidence enough to ask for an e-mail address or mobile phone number with a view to organizing a "real world" meeting. The meeting is the real purpose behind this subterfuge. Others suggest webcam photo sessions which turn out to be pornographic.
- 47. The effects of Internet child pornography on children are better known: images of child sexual exploitation and the dissemination of those images compound the consequences of the child abuse, affecting the victims' recovery and the delivery of the services available to them. Images of sexually exploited children disseminated on the Internet will in fact never disappear and this has a devastating effect on victims. The victims do not want to tell; blame themselves; are even more traumatized; are ashamed to think that others might see the images on the Internet; are less likely to provide information; and need more time to recover from the abuse than if the images had not been recorded. Furthermore, many abusers force the victim to pretend that they are enjoying the experience, which is why a victim might fear that the police will believe that they welcomed the abuse. Photographs and videos of sexually exploited children may in some cases appear to contradict the authorities' perceptions and ideas about child victims of sexual exploitation (as always being victims who were forced to commit such acts).
- 48. Researchers at ECPAT International also emphasize that "Practitioners report that a child in this situation may feel that the existence of imagery of their humiliation masks the violence they have experienced and makes them appear complicit. This dilemma adds an extra traumatic burden." For some victims the abuse becomes something so normal that their behaviour may become misleading.
- 49. The constant circulation of images of sexually exploited children exponentially increases the difficulty victims have in turning the page and recovering. Even when the abuse is a thing of the past, victims continue to be traumatized because the images are still in circulation and being used for sexual gratification. That fact is compounded by the fear that something so personal from their past may reappear anywhere, at any time and be seen by anyone.
- 50. This is a never-ending violation of the right to privacy which causes additional humiliation. Victims grow up knowing that those photographs or videos will be on the Internet for the rest of their lives.

⁵ ECPAT International: "A contribution to the Third World Congress against Sexual Exploitation of Children and Adolescents", 2008.

⁶ ECPAT International, Violence against Children in Cyberspace, Bangkok, 2005, page 40. (http://www.ecpat.net/EI/Publications/ICT/Cyberspace_FRE.pdf).

- 51. Exposure of children to child pornography inspires and influences the sexual practices of young people. It affects their behaviour. Pornography is their main source of information about sex and serves as an example for real sexuality, thereby facilitating the spread of behaviours associated with it.⁷
- 52. Networks for the exchange of child pornography display photographs in which the children have been forced to smile in order to prove that they "are having fun" and to make being sexually attracted to children seem legitimate and normal.

D. Legislative framework

- 53. While many countries have legislation containing provisions that criminalize Internet child pornography, some States, for example Oman or Iraq, have no legislation specifically dealing with child pornography. Pornography is considered to be an offence against public morals and decency or a violation of public order and child pornography is punished in that context.
- 54. There are significant differences in legislation, which reveal differences in how States view Internet child pornography, its seriousness and the sheer size of the problem.

1. Age of the child

55. Some countries define a child as an individual under the age of 18, but others take into account the age of criminal responsibility or the age of consent to sexual activity, which may vary between 13 and 16. The Special Rapporteur wishes to stress that the age of consent to sexual activity must not be taken into account, because a child under 18 cannot be considered to be able to consent to sexual exploitation, including child pornography.

2. Definition of Internet pornography

- 56. While some countries (e.g. the United States and South Africa) have legislation that clearly defines all forms of Internet child pornography, other countries' legislation does not address virtual and simulated pornography. Some legislation does not distinguish between child pornography and child erotica, which incurs lesser penalties.
- 57. In some States (e.g. Finland and Slovakia) watching child pornography, visiting child pornography sites without downloading material and possession of child pornography are all punishable.
- 58. Solicitation of children for sexual purposes via the Internet is (grooming) is punishable in some countries (Italy, Monaco, the United Kingdom and the United States). It should also be recalled that article 23 of the Council of Europe Convention on the Protection of Children against Sexual Exploitation and Sexual Abuse prohibits solicitation of children for sexual purposes (grooming).

⁷ Ibid, pages 52-55.

3. Criminalization of perpetrators and the penalties imposed

- 59. Penalties vary considerably from State to State, from lengthy prison terms to fines, based on the age of the child and the type of child pornography. In the United States the dissemination of child pornography over the Internet is punishable by a fine and imprisonment of 5 to 20 years. In Peru the law imposes more severe penalties if the victim is under the age of 14; belonging to a child pornography ring is another aggravating circumstance. In Italy, in addition to criminal penalties, the authorities may seize the guilty party's possessions as well as any proceeds obtained from child pornography.
- 60. Some laws leave it to the judge's discretion to impose a fine and/or imprisonment on a producer of child pornography (Indonesia and Japan).

4. Legal responsibility of Internet service providers (ISPs)

- 61. In the United States and Australia there are penalties for Internet service providers and domain hosts who do not report child pornography sites to the police within a reasonable period of time. In South Africa an ISP must take whatever steps necessary to prevent its services from being used to host or distribute child pornography material. The ISP must notify such activity to the police, as well as the abuser's particulars (name and Internet Protocol (IP) address); the ISP is also obliged to keep a record of that information for use as evidence in legal investigations and proceedings.
- 62. The United States and South Africa have laws that authorize the police to order an ISP, in the context of a criminal investigation, to keep a record of data about a specific person or IP address, pending issuance of the appropriate warrant requiring disclosure of that information.
- 63. In Thailand ISPs are required by law to keep child pornography and data concerning the user of such sites stored for at least 90 days.
- 64. Another problem that the police increasingly face is data encryption. The United Kingdom and Australia have already passed laws to help the police gain access to password- or encryption-protected computers and materials. Those laws require the owners of computers protected by a password or containing encrypted data to collaborate with the police. Refusal to cooperate is punishable by imprisonment.
- 65. Most national legislations do not require ISPs, telephone service providers or banking services to report the detection of pornographic sites involving children on their networks or to cooperate with the authorities in that regard.

5. Principle of extraterritoriality

66. Many States (Italy, Japan, South Africa, Switzerland and the United States) invoke the principle of extraterritoriality with regard to cases of child exploitation or abuse by one of their nationals while abroad. Other countries, however, continue to apply the principle of double jeopardy.

6. Victims' right to privacy

- 67. In Finland the police may block child pornography sites in order to prevent the circulation on the Internet of images of children being sexually exploited. In South Africa ISPs are required by law to take steps to block the dissemination of such images.
- 68. In the United States, in child pornography prosecutions, the law provides that the Government or the court shall have responsibility for and custody and control of any object or material relating to child pornography; the courts must deny all requests from the defence to copy, photocopy or reproduce, by any means, child pornography material.

7. Reparation for victims

- 69. Article 8 of the Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on the sale of children, child prostitution and child pornography requires States parties to adopt appropriate measures to protect the rights and interests of child victims of the practices prohibited under the present Protocol at all stages of the criminal justice process. They must also take all feasible measures with the aim of ensuring all appropriate assistance to victims of such offences, including their full social reintegration and their full physical and psychological recovery (art. 9, para. 3). Moreover, States parties must ensure that all child victims of the offences described in the present Protocol have access to adequate procedures to seek, without discrimination, compensation for damages from those legally responsible (art. 9, para. 4).
- 70. Switzerland has amended its victim assistance law by extending from two to five years the time limit for filing compensation or moral reparation claims. The children may by law file at any time for the medical, psychological, social, material and legal assistance they require following the offence. In Finland the State has secondary responsibility by law for providing compensation for damages and injury suffered if the guilty party defaults on payments. The same is true in Liechtenstein.
- 71. Lastly, certain States still do not have legislation for providing for compensation measures for child victims of Internet pornography or for follow-up and care.

E. Existing measures

- 72. The vast majority of States have established national action plans for the protection of children from all forms of sexual violence and exploitation, and strategies to combat organized crime, in particular cybercrime. In addition, mechanisms for preventing and combating child pornography have been implemented by individual States and at the regional and international levels.
- 73. Does that mean that all child victims are identified, that their rights are fully respected and that they receive compensation and appropriate care until they have fully recovered? Does that mean that children who use all the new technologies are fully aware of and protected against the risks associated with exposure to pornographic material and sexual solicitation?

1. Identification of child victims still difficult

- 74. Identifying and establishing the whereabouts of a child who has participated in pornographic scenes are difficult tasks for the authorities. Even once the victim is identified, it can be very difficult to help them deal with the trauma caused by participation in the acts in question, because the victim realizes that those images have been saved, disseminated or distributed in one form or another. In order to identify and track down child victims of online sexual exploitation many countries have established units specializing in combating child pornography, which cooperate with The International Criminal Police Organization (INTERPOL), Europol, the FBI, etc.
- 75. However, identifying victims is a key step but remains difficult and very dependent on the information available from ISPs and, therefore, on their cooperation. Given that most ISPs are not obliged to keep records of the sites their clients have visited, they may be unable to provide any information because the site has been taken off the system.
- 76. Rapid acquisition of information about sexual predators (name and IP address) has been facilitated in some countries (South Africa, the United Kingdom and the United States) by the adoption of a law requiring ISPs to provide information to the police without the need for a court order.
- 77. Identification of child victims of sexual abuse through image analysis is essential because many victims do not lodge a complaint with the police. Image analysis, which has led to the rescue of hundreds of children around the world, is a highly specialized and rigorous process that requires a great deal of time, enormous expertise and leading-edge computer technology. It is an expensive investment that the developing countries cannot afford.
- 78. In order to coordinate efforts aimed at identifying children through image analysis and help manage large quantities of evidence, law enforcement agencies around the world are preparing databases of known images of sexually exploited children. INTERPOL has created such a database.
- 79. The INTERPOL/Child Abuse Image Database (ICAID) contains more than 550,000 images submitted by member countries. It uses image recognition software to link images from a single series of abuses or taken at the same location and has helped investigators identify and rescue 870 victims around the world. The sharing of images enables police authorities to deliver more rapid assistance to victims at the national and international levels. Such databases also contain information on victims already identified and rescued, which saves other police services the task of pointless investigations.
- 80. In the United States the authorities send all images to the National Center for Missing & Exploited Children (NCMEC, established in 2003). The NCMEC Child Victim Identification Program is a national information centre for child pornography cases in the country and is the main focal point for international bodies. Its analysts try to identify victims and individuals involved in the sale, exchange and distribution of images. To date, NCMEC has processed more

than 15 million photos and videos and helped identify more than 1,600 children. For example, a series of images depicting one girl led to the opening of more than 13,000 investigations in the United States alone.

- 81. In the United Kingdom the Child Exploitation and Online Protection (CEOP) Centre has likewise created an image bank which has helped rescue 18 children. National information and coordination centres, such as Australia's and Canada's National Child Exploitation Coordination Centre (NCECC), serve as clearing houses for information relating to sexual exploitation of children on the Internet and respond to international requests to undertake investigations within the country. Italy has established a similar mechanism, the Monitoring Centre to Combat Paedophilia and Child Pornography.
- 82. Image banks alone are not enough. Specialized analysis is also required; expertise and know-how in the area of identification of victims of sexual abuse are essential and crucial factors in effectively tackling this problem. In most countries police officers are regularly trained in the skills needed for identifying and interviewing child victims. This training is provided by groups experienced in the areas of cybercrime and assistance to child victims. Mechanisms that can contribute multidisciplinary skills, including expertise in victim identification techniques, support the work of the police: NCMEC in the United States, NCECC in Canada, the CEOP Centre in the United Kingdom and the National Child Exploitation Centre (NCECC) in Australia.
- 83. While the total number of identified victims is not known, statistics on sexual predators arrested and/or convicted are more readily available. For example, in the United States, 3,884 individuals were convicted in 2007-2008; as of 31 March 2009, 12,085 sexual predators had been arrested, 6,237 of them deported from the United States. In Japan there were 676 arrests in 2008; in 2005 police in Australia made 191 arrests; in Italy 182 individuals were convicted in 2005.

2. Inadequate protection of child victims

- 84. Child pornography victims, once identified, receive more or less comprehensive care, depending on the country. Integrated programmes providing support and follow-up services to child victims of sexual abuse and exploitation on the Internet (and to their families), as provided for in the Guidelines on Justice in Matters involving Child Victims and Witnesses of Crimes, are still relatively rare. It has become apparent that the professionals often work in isolation and do not always communicate effectively with one another or with the children and their families, resulting in uncoordinated support that does not offer protection appropriate to the child's age, level of maturity or individual needs in order to ensure that involvement in the criminal justice process inflicts no additional hardship or trauma.
- 85. In order to provide appropriate assistance and protection based on the needs of the child, some States have launched a number of initiatives: in the United States, 900 Children's Advocacy Centers (CACs), 600 of them accredited by the National Children's Alliance (NCA), have child- and family-friendly centres where child victims receive comprehensive and multidisciplinary care until they are completely stabilized or recovered; in Ontario (Canada),

more than 385 victims have been assisted and over 90 people have accessed the special compensation fund for helping victims and their families to receive counselling. In other countries (among them South Africa) the courts adopt specific procedures so as not to inflict additional trauma on the child. In many countries there are various NGOs that offer programmes and care and counselling facilities for child victims and their families.

- 86. There is growing recognition that images of sexual exploitation of children and dissemination of those images exacerbate the consequences of abuse and have repercussions on the victims' recovery and the delivery of the services on offer. As the children grow up they know that their images are in the hands of lawyers and law enforcement specialists, who process and store the images to be used as evidence, as well as by users of the Internet, where the images will continue to circulate for the rest of their lives. This is a never-ending violation of these children's right to privacy. How, then, can these images be responsibly managed? While image banks have proven useful, the consequences of storing and exchange of images for the victims must not be ignored. Victims do not necessarily draw a distinction between the persons looking at their images or the reasons they are looking at them.
- 87. How can we put an end to the circulation of such images on the Internet? Unfortunately, there is no way of locating and destroying all the images of children being sexually exploited in circulation on the Internet. That said, Governments and the private sector can take steps to restrict the dissemination of such material and discourage offenders from accessing it. In 2007, during the G-8 Justice and Interior Ministers Meeting, the participants agreed that the war against cyberpredators could not be won by the police alone. They noted that the private sector must play an important role in protecting children the world over.
- 88. Despite the efforts made and successes achieved, the relatively small number of victims identified proves that much remains to be done in this field.

3. Inadequate protection for child Internet users worldwide

- 89. The increasingly interactive nature of online content, social networking, video sharing and instant messaging offer users new opportunities but also bring new risks for children and youth. For example, the technological convergence of mobile phones and the Internet likewise has significant consequences for online safety, and mobile Internet access outside the home or school gives children and youth new forms of communication and makes them more trusting.
- 90. In response to such risks many telephone hotlines have been established by States, NGOs, and ISPs. The lines can be either national or international, even if based in a particular country: Internet Watch Foundation in the United Kingdom; the Association of Internet Hotline Providers (INHOPE), currently with 35 hotlines in 35 countries; NCMEC CyberTipline (United States); and the European alert platform.

⁸ Office of the Federal Ombudsman for Victims of Crime, "Every Image, Every Child: Internet-facilitated Child Sexual Abuse in Canada", 2009.

- 91. Such telephone hotlines for the public to report any image of child sexual abuse on the Internet, mobile phones, social networks and chat rooms, have frequently led to the identification and blocking of new child pornography sites (2,500 in Switzerland; 164 in Italy; 532 in the Netherlands; 1,864 in Japan, etc.). Operators of hotline services report all such sites to the police, notify ISPs about sites hosted on their servers and help them prevent the use of their systems for the dissemination of criminal material.
- 92. Hotlines also play a role in counselling, raising awareness, and informing Internet users about the risks and dangers for children if they are exposed to child pornography and "grooming".
- 93. In order to increase children's safety, abuse buttons have been added to sites used by children, who can use them to report any illicit content or sexual solicitation (Norway and the United Kingdom). An abuse button has even been placed in Windows Live Messenger.
- 94. Education, awareness and information programmes have been launched in the great majority of States. In order to prevent sexual exploitation of children on the Internet, Governments, NGOs and the new technologies business sector have entered into partnerships for the production and dissemination of educational material aimed at children, young people, parents and persons working with children.
- 95. The European Commission has developed the Safer Internet Plus Programme and funded initiatives aimed at making the Internet safer, such as the development of filters and information and educational tools on the risks associated with Internet use by children. As part of that programme, a Safer Internet Day is celebrated every year in February, the purpose of which is to increase public awareness of safety issues in the context of the use of new technologies. On Safer Internet Day 2008 a new online voting platform and an e-safety toolkit for children and parents were created.
- 96. The Insafe network, which coordinates Safer Internet Day activities, has 26 national awareness centres. It plays an important role in strengthening exchange of best practices in the promotion of online safety in Europe.
- 97. The Insafe network has entered into a series of partnerships with leading information and communication enterprises in order to be able to use the most appropriate technology to educate the public in online safety. In order to meet the needs of teachers, a consortium of 14 leading commercial partners, including mobile network operators and social network providers, this year launched the educational website www.teachtoday.eu. In addition to partnerships with the business sector, the Insafe network has worked with the Council of Europe to update the Council's Internet information and introduction tool, the Internet Literacy Handbook, by adding new sections on Web 2.0, social networks and online assistance. Training sessions have been

⁹ The third edition of this handbook is available in two languages (http://www.coe.int/t/dghl/StandardSetting/InternetLiteracy/hbk_en.asp).

organized for Insafe network members to upgrade their understanding of leading-edge technologies and teach them how to increase awareness among new generations of Internet users.

- 98. In Egypt, the Government, in partnership with Microsoft and NGOs, has developed material in Arabic aimed at promoting safe use of the Internet by children. In follow-up to the recommendations made at the International Conference on Effective Strategies for the Prevention of Child Online Pornography, Trafficking and Abuse, held in Bahrain in 2009, a handbook for children, young people, parents and professionals working with children is being prepared.
- 99. During the ECPAT make-IT-safe campaign¹⁰ in the Philippines, 600 Internet cafe managers adopted a code of conduct and developed mechanisms to guarantee the protection and safety of children using the Internet. In Peru, municipal Internet squads monitor public areas with Internet access and help them install filters to protect children.
- 100. Despite the tremendous efforts of all stakeholders in many countries, to date no study has been able to measure their impact.
- 101. Furthermore, those efforts have occurred mainly in the countries of the North; it would be desirable to expand and develop them in the countries of the South and thus make them available to children no matter where they are.

4. Moderate level of participation by children

102. In Australia the children that make up the Youth Advisory Group are also members of the advisory working group established under the country's Plan for Cyber-Safety. The Youth Advisory Group cooperates with police, regularly updating them on developments in Internet use by children (for example, trends and languages); it also organizes awareness-raising activities in schools. In April 2008 the Today's Youth Forum gave children aged between 11 and 16 an opportunity to discuss what needed to be done for more effective protection of child Internet users. From 19 to 21 July 2008 the International Youth Advisory Congress (IYAC) brought together 150 children from 19 countries¹¹ in London and drafted a Children and Young People's Global Online Charter ¹² aimed at making the Internet safer for children.

¹⁰ ECPAT international has organized similar campaigns in 67 countries (http://www.make-it-safe.net/eng/index.asp).

¹¹ Argentina, Australia, Canada, Denmark, Egypt, Greece, Iceland, India, Ireland, Italy, Namibia, Netherlands, New Zealand, Poland, Spain, Sweden, United Kingdom, United States and Zimbabwe.

¹² Available online: www.ayac.net/iyac charter.pdf.

103. While many initiatives have been undertaken to educate children and alert them to the risks associated with use of communication technologies, children continue to play a relatively modest role in the development and implementation of strategies to prevent and combat child pornography on the Internet.

5. An increasingly mobilized private sector

- 104. A number of ISPs, mobile telephone operators and bank card companies have adopted codes of conduct in an attempt at self-regulation. Enterprises that have done so have committed themselves to steps to combat child pornography, install filters on certain sites, classify sites according to their content, report sites with illegal content to the police and provide it with information on those sites.
- 105. All five mobile telephone operators that are members of the Mobile Broadband Group in the United Kingdom are members of the Internet Watch Foundation, which works in cooperation with the Internet industry in the United Kingdom, the police and various ministries, including the Home Office and the Department of Trade and Industry, with a view to contributing to initiatives and programmes developed to combat child abuse on the Internet.
- 106. In Brazil a memorandum of understanding has been signed between the SaferNet Brazil Hotline and Google Brazil for the purpose of reporting child pornography on websites and social networks (including Orkut, a social networking site that is very popular in Brazil and Southern Asia).
- 107. In Luxembourg, on 10 February 2009, Safer Internet Day, social networking sites active in Europe, including MySpace, Bebo, Facebook, Google and Piczo signed a memorandum of understanding on online safety. The European Commission is responsible for monitoring implementation of that agreement.
- 108. The European Financial Coalition (EFC) to fight child abuse images distribution on the Internet includes financial institutions, credit card companies, third-party payers and ISPs which have made a commitment to combating child pornography on the Internet. Its objective is to erode the profitability of child pornography by tracking the origin of funds and closing the accounts used by illegal enterprises. The Coalition cooperates with the authorities, the information technology industry and children's rights agencies and intends to expand the scope of its operations to the international level in order to provide a comprehensive response to the problem. To that end, the Coalition cooperates with ECPAT International and has expanded its operations to the Asia-Pacific region.
- 109. Google has developed a programme to assist NCMEC in identifying child abuse images and is helping NCMEC analyse these images. The programme uses a shape recognition system that helps analysts sort and identify files containing child sexual abuse material.

http://ec.europa.eu/information_society/activities/social_networking/eu_action/selfreg/index en.htm.

F. International cooperation

- 110. Thanks to the cooperation mechanisms developed by national police forces, child victims have been identified, sexual predators arrested and international networks dismantled. In 2007 Operation Carousel led to the arrest of 700 suspects in 35 countries, the confiscation of 76,000 images of children, and the identification of 31 of the children involved.
- 111. With a view to coordinating their efforts and making them more effective, a number of countries, in particular the industrialized countries, cooperate regularly with the Group of Eight (G-8), the United Nations Commission on Crime Prevention and Criminal Justice, the Council of Europe, INTERPOL and Europol.
- 112. Discussions are under way among the United States, EUROJUST and Europol on the creation of an expert group.
- 113. National police authorities good cooperation with one another and with INTERPOL has facilitated increased training opportunities for police officers from many countries; exchange of information; creation of an image bank; numerous victim identification programmes; development of a child exploitation tracking system, etc.
- 114. The G-8 countries, in the context of their strategy against sexual exploitation of children on the Internet adopted in 2003 have made a commitment to collecting and exchanging information, cooperating with the private sector and NGOs, and expanding their efforts to countries not members of the G-8.
- 115. Regional cooperation efforts (in North America, Central and South America and Asia) are working relatively well. In the European Union cooperation among member countries focuses on harmonization of practices, development of expertise, funding of programmes and exchange of information.
- 116. The Virtual Global Taskforce (VGT), established in 2003, is an excellent example of international cooperation. Its objectives are to identify children, ascertain the whereabouts of and assist children at risk, and identify predators with a view to holding them to account for their actions. The VGT comprises the Child Exploitation and Online Protection (CEOP) Centre; INTERPOL; the Australian Federal Police NCECC; the United States Department of Homeland Security and United States Immigration and Customs Enforcement; and the Italian Postal and Communication Police Service.¹⁴
- 117. Bilateral and multilateral agreements facilitate reciprocal assistance between States. For example, in the context of its cooperation with South-East Asia, Australia has provided equipment and training for police in Thailand and Viet Nam.

¹⁴ http://www.virtualglobaltaskforce.com/.

- 118. In April 2009 in South America, national coalitions and NGOs from seven countries (Costa Rica, El Salvador, Guatemala, Honduras, Mexico, Nicaragua and Panama) adopted a declaration following a seminar on the development of comprehensive strategies to combat child pornography.
- 119. North-South cooperation continues to be relatively modest in the area of combating child pornography on the Internet.
- 120. The many activities undertaken by numerous stakeholders in various countries are adversely affected by lack of coordination and harmonization.
- 121. Since there are no borders between countries for Internet users, international cooperation would benefit from being broader, more effective and more efficient, and from harmonization of practices and procedures.

III. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

- 122. Despite the many actions undertaken and a measure of success, further progress must be made with a view to identifying more children, protecting children better and fully guaranteeing their rights.
- 123. To that end, child pornography must, first and foremost, be declared a crime and a grave violation of children's rights that seriously affects their dignity and physical and psychological integrity.
- 124. In order to prevent and eradicate child pornography and prevent the Internet and new technologies from being used for the production and dissemination of child pornography and solicitation of children for sexual purposes both online and offline, the Special Rapporteur recommends:
- (a) Ratification by States that have not yet done so of the regional and international instruments dealing with child pornography, in particular the Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on the sale of children, child prostitution and child pornography;
- (b) Adoption of clear and comprehensive domestic legislation that guarantees respect for children's rights and protects them from the crime of sexual exploitation on the Internet. Such legislation should:
 - (i) Define, prohibit and criminalize child pornography on the Internet, in accordance with international human rights instruments, defining a minor as a human being under the age of 18;
 - (ii) Stipulate that a minor can never be considered to be in a position to consent to participation in sexual exploitation, including pornographic activities;

- (iii) Criminalize the production, distribution, intentional receipt and possession of child pornography, including virtual images and representations that exploit children, as well as the acts of intentionally using, accessing and watching such material even in the absence of any physical contact with the child;
- (iv) Criminalize solicitation of children on the Internet for sexual purposes ("grooming");
- (v) Require Internet service providers (ISPs), mobile telephone operators, search engines and other stakeholders to report any violations to the police; block access to the sites; keep records, in accordance with established standards, for the purpose of investigation and prosecution before the courts;
- (vi) Require financial institutions to report, block and impede the functioning of the financial mechanisms that provide a foundation for child pornography sites;
- (vii) Oblige all ISPs to block access to sites that contain images of children being sexually exploited, in order to protect the privacy of victims;
- (viii) Ensure that child victims of sexual exploitation are not considered to be criminals or punished for acts directly linked to their exploitation, but are deemed, rather, to be victims of human rights violations receive appropriate care;
 - (ix) Establish extraterritorial jurisdiction for all cases of sexual exploitation of children and adolescents and abolish the principle of double jeopardy, facilitate mutual legal assistance with a view to guaranteeing the effective prosecution of such crimes and the imposition of appropriate penalties, and consider all acts involving sexual exploitation of children and adolescents to be covered in existing and subsequent extradition treaties;
- (c) The identification and protection of victims as well as provision of assistance and care by specialized personnel, which should be assigned high priority. That involves:
 - (i) Training professionals to spot child victims of sexual predators more effectively and rapidly by providing them with access to the necessary information (name, address and encrypted or password-protected data) and by making available the expertise and resources they need to develop more effective methods of image analysis;
 - (ii) Providing a framework for and encouraging the collection and exchange of information and cross-border communication and adding to the database on victims and perpetrators with a view to more effective action to help children;

- (iii) Promoting public/private partnerships for research into and development of technologies that will facilitate investigations and the identification of victims, in order to put an immediate end to exploitation and provide victims with the assistance they need for a full recovery;
- (iv) Promoting and defending the right to privacy of child victims and child perpetrators of sexual exploitation, taking into account existing domestic laws and judicial procedures, in order to protect their identity at all stages of investigations and judicial procedures; preventing the public dissemination of information that could help identify them; and ensuring that the measures taken are appropriate for the children and facilitate their participation in the entire judicial process;
- (v) Allocating the resources and expertise needed to assist victims and their families and to care for them until such time as the child has fully recovered;
- (vi) Putting an end to the circulation of images of child sexual exploitation in order to spare victims any further humiliation, by maintaining a worldwide list of Internet sites containing images of sexual abuse of children, constantly updated and available to States. The list will enable police services and ISPs to block access to the sites in question;
- (d) Broader and more effective social responsibility on the part of the private sector. In that respect ISPs, mobile telephone operators, Internet cafes, financial institutions and other stakeholders should:
 - (i) Work out and implement voluntary codes of conduct;
 - (ii) Support and develop measures for preventing not only the production and dissemination of child pornography, including visual images and depictions of children of an exploitative nature, but also the use of the Internet and other information technologies for online or offline "grooming" of children;
 - (iii) Undertake actions to detect and dismantle the financial mechanisms used to conclude transactions for the purpose of sexual exploitation of children;
 - (iv) Support efforts aimed at eliminating demand and improve assistance to child victims and their families, in particular by means of telephone hotlines or Internet services;
 - (v) Support the development of education and awareness campaigns for children, parents, educators, youth associations, and associations that work with and for children, focusing on the risks of sexual exploitation and the use of the Internet, mobile telephones and new technologies for exploitation, and self-protection measures;

- (e) Improved prevention, which calls for:
 - (i) Evaluating the prevention programmes undertaken to date, with a view to measuring their effect;
 - (ii) Organizing education and awareness campaigns for children, parents, teachers, youth associations and other persons working with and for children, with a view to increasing their knowledge about the risk of sexual exploitation associated with use of the Internet, mobile telephones and other new technologies. Such campaigns should devote particular attention to how children can protect themselves, receive help and report online child pornography and sexual exploitation;
 - (iii) Establishing partnerships with the media to develop audio-visual programmes for children, families and the public, aimed at increasing their awareness of and keeping them informed about the risks associated with Internet use by children;
 - (iv) Make technologies accessible, affordable and user-friendly to parents, guardians and educators, especially filters to block images of children that could be impropriate or harmful;
- (f) Increased participation by children, which requires:
 - (i) Keeping children informed and teaching them how to protect themselves, seek help and report sites and "grooming";
 - (ii) Promoting the participation of children and young people at all stages of the development, follow-up to and evaluation of policies and programmes; in campaigns; and through assistance programmes by and for children, aimed at increasing awareness of and preventing online child pornography;
 - (iii) Considering the establishment of a fund for initiatives on the part of children and young people in this area;
- (g) Increased international cooperation because the absence of borders between countries on the Internet requires effective and efficient cooperation to protect children everywhere, which calls for:
 - (i) Harmonizing practices and procedures in the areas of information, access to and exchange of information, storing of computer data, regulation of the public-private partnership between services responsible for applying the law and ISPs, and training and content methods;
 - (ii) Developing interdisciplinary and multi-country working groups;
 - (iii) Establishing an international mechanism for reporting Internet-related offences;

- (iv) Providing economic, technical or other assistance through existing multilateral, regional and bilateral programmes aimed at combating online child pornography in the developing countries;
- (v) Broadening the scope of activities to prevent and combat child pornography, currently concentrated mostly in the countries of the North, to include the countries of the South, thereby making them accessible to all children, wherever they may be;
- (vi) Capitalizing and dissemination of practices and tools within countries and among all countries;
- (vii) Conclusion of multilateral agreements, especially on police investigations;
- (viii) Adoption of coordinated action at the national and international levels to combat criminal organizations involved in sexual exploitation of children and to ensure the prosecution of all individuals and/or legal persons involved in this form of organized crime.
