



# Conference of the States Parties to the United Nations Convention against Corruption

Distr.: General  
31 August 2020

English only

## Open-ended Intergovernmental Working Group on the Prevention of Corruption

Vienna, 31 August–2 September 2020

Item 2 (a) of the provisional agenda\*

**Implementation of relevant Conference  
resolutions: good practices and initiatives in the  
prevention of corruption: enhancing the  
effectiveness of anti-corruption bodies (article 6 of  
the United Nations Convention against  
Corruption)**

## Enhancing the effectiveness of anti-corruption bodies (article 6, paragraphs 1 and 2, of the United Nations Convention against Corruption)

Background paper prepared by the Secretariat

Addendum

### I. Introduction

1. The present addendum has been prepared by the secretariat of the Conference of the States Parties to the United Nations Convention against Corruption to supplement the background paper [CAC/COSP/WG.4/2020/4](#) on enhancing the effectiveness of anti-corruption bodies (article 6, paragraphs 1 and 2, of the United Nations Convention against Corruption).
2. The present addendum has been prepared based on the information provided by Governments after 5 March 2020 on the implementation of article 6 of the Convention in response to a note verbale of the Secretariat dated 5 February 2020. The initial background paper covered all responses received by 5 March 2020. As at 12 August 2020, 12 additional submissions had been received from the following parties to the Convention: Armenia, Belarus, Burundi, Ecuador, El Salvador, Ghana, Mexico, Qatar, Russian Federation, Senegal, State of Palestine and Ukraine.
3. With the agreement of the respondents, the full text of their submissions has been made available on the UNODC website<sup>1</sup> and incorporated into the thematic web page developed by the Secretariat.<sup>2</sup>
4. The present addendum does not purport to be comprehensive but rather endeavours to provide a summary of the additional information provided by parties.

\* [CAC/COSP/WG.4/2020/1](#).

<sup>1</sup> See [www.unodc.org/unodc/en/corruption/WG-Prevention/session11.html](#).

<sup>2</sup> See [www.unodc.org/unodc/en/corruption/WG-Prevention/preventive-anti-corruption-bodies](#).



The thematic background for this addendum is the same as for the background paper [CAC/COSP/WG.4/2020/4](#), as reflected in its paragraphs 9-21. This report only reflects additional information received on country examples of elements to enhance the effectiveness of anti-corruption bodies, performance indicators and ways to assess effectiveness, as highlighted by respondents in their submissions.

## **II. Analysis of submissions by parties and signatories**

### **A. Elements to enhance effectiveness**

5. Respondents emphasized the same elements that enhance the effectiveness of anti-corruption bodies as already reflected in the background paper [CAC/COSP/WG.4/2020/4](#).

#### **1. Independence**

6. In El Salvador, the Court of Government Ethics enjoys technical, administrative and financial autonomy. The five members of the Court are appointed by various institutions (the Legislative Assembly, the President of the Republic, the Supreme Court of Justice, the Court of Auditors and the Office of the Attorney General). The law on Government ethics specifies the grounds and procedure applicable to the removal of members of the Court.

7. In Qatar, the Administrative Control and Transparency Authority enjoys legal personality and financial autonomy. The President of the Authority has the power to draw up the general policy, plans, programmes and projects of the Authority, to supervise their implementation and to propose legal reforms.

8. In the Russian Federation, the independence of the Presidential Council on Combating Corruption and the Office of the President of the Russian Federation on Combating Corruption is ensured by their position in the hierarchy of public bodies. They report directly to the President.

9. In Senegal, the National Office against Fraud and Corruption is an independent administrative body with financial autonomy. The officials are recruited among judges, members of the administration, academia, civil society and the private sector. In the performance of their duties, they cannot receive instructions from any authority.

10. In the State of Palestine, the Anti-Corruption Commission has legal personality, enjoys administrative and financial independence and a special budget is allocated for it within the national budget of the Palestinian National Authority. The Commission's employees are subject to a separate legal framework. This enhances the authority's independence and minimizes the risk of interference by other bodies. The Commission counts 56 employees working at its headquarters in Ramallah. Twenty of them are responsible for preventing corruption. The Commission's staff, including its President, enjoy functional immunity.

#### **2. Specialized staff and training**

11. In Ecuador, a judicial training school exists with specialist trainers on criminal law. The school comprises training centers in the capital and two decentralized locations. It also has developed a virtual training platform. Several training courses have been organized for judicial officials on new legislation, the links between corruption and organized crime, money-laundering and international cooperation. A general guide on corruption and organized crime has also been developed and disseminated.

12. In El Salvador, a specialized Communications Unit is entrusted with the preparation of materials and the organization of awareness-raising campaigns. A Training Unit is responsible for the organization of events and training of members of the Court of Government Ethics. An annual training budget and a training room for

60 persons is available at the Court. A “virtual classroom” has also been set up to provide a platform for e-learning on public ethics and anti-corruption issues to members of the Court and its decentralized Commissions.

13. In Qatar, the Administrative Control and Transparency Authority has specialized and qualified staff appointed on the basis of professional and technical criteria which are based on integrity, transparency and anti-corruption.

14. In the Russian Federation, extensive training is provided to public prosecutors, including on ethics.

15. In the State of Palestine, the Anti-Corruption Commission strives continuously to strengthen the capacity of its employees to enable them to carry out their duties with high efficiency. Internal and external training courses in specialized fields related to preventing and combating corruption are regularly provided.

16. In Ukraine, the National Agency on Corruption Prevention employed 270 staff as of the end of 2019, 166 of them were trained in 2019.

### **3. Financial and material resources**

17. In Mexico, the anti-corruption bodies have reportedly received considerable budgetary allocations under the 2020 federal budget.

18. In Qatar, the Administrative Control and Transparency Authority has financial autonomy. The President of the Authority is responsible for running the administrative, financial and technical affairs and for providing an annual budget estimate, which is annexed to the State’s general budget, upon approval. The financial resources are mainly provided by the State.

19. In the Russian Federation, the operations of the Presidential Council on Combating Corruption and the Office of the President of the Russian Federation on Combating Corruption are reported to be adequately resourced.

20. In Senegal, the major part of the budget of the National Office against Fraud and Corruption comes from the national budget. The Office has financial autonomy to manage its budget and define its priorities.

21. In Ukraine, the budget of the National Agency on Corruption Prevention is part of the general State budget. It was of 20 million United States dollars in 2019 and 25 million United States dollars in 2020.

### **4. National and international cooperation**

22. In Belarus, the overall coordination of the fight against corruption is the responsibility of the General Prosecution Office. In the public sector, bodies and commissions are formed with overall responsibility to implement corruption prevention measures. Together with the other States participating in the Commonwealth of Independent States, Belarus takes part in the Interstate Council on counteracting corruption.

23. In Burundi, the Ministry of Good Governance and Planning is the body responsible for coordinating the prevention of corruption. Other institutions, such as the Court of Auditors, the General Inspectorate of the State and the National Directorate for the Control of Public Procurement, also have mandates to prevent corruption. Coordination between the institutions is ensured through regular meetings.

24. In Ecuador, inter-institutional cooperation on anti-corruption is facilitated by a formal agreement between various institutions, including the Judicial Council, the Anti-Corruption Secretariat of the Presidency of the Republic, the Comptroller General of the State, the Office of the Attorney General and the Financial Intelligence Unit.

25. In El Salvador, the Court of Government Ethics is composed of a plenary chamber and of collegial bodies set up in various institutions (among others, the Legislative Assembly, Presidency of the Republic, Supreme Court of Justice, Secretariats of State, National Council of the Judiciary, Court of Auditors of the Republic, Office of the Attorney General, University of El Salvador).

26. In Mexico, a Coordination Committee for the National Anti-Corruption System has been established to develop the national policy on anti-corruption coordination for all institutions involved in the prevention of and fight against corruption.

27. In Qatar, the Administrative Control and Transparency Authority has launched a website which includes information on foreign authorities, in order to facilitate international cooperation.

28. In the Russian Federation, various anti-corruption bodies exist, including the Presidential Council on Combating Corruption, the Office of the President of the Russian Federation on Combating Corruption and Anti-Corruption Units and Commissions of State and municipal authorities. Furthermore, the Office of the Public Prosecutor oversees the implementation of the anti-corruption legislation. The Ministry of Labour issues methodological recommendations and guidance to public bodies on the implementation of the anti-corruption plans and programmes. All federal State authorities, State authorities, and local government bodies carry out anti-corruption functions within their competences.

29. In the State of Palestine, the Anti-Corruption Commission has signed memorandums of understanding with public institutions and civil society organizations, implemented training programmes in the field of preventing corruption and involved its partners in the drafting of the successive anti-corruption strategies.

## **5. Monitoring and evaluation**

30. In El Salvador, “accountability exercises” have been carried out since 2017 to assess the activities undertaken by the Court of Government Ethics. The reports based on these assessment exercises are available online and subjected to citizen scrutiny and feedback. Annually, an “ethics week” is organized where the institution’s work is presented to the public. Client satisfaction surveys are also regularly undertaken during events and meetings organized by the Court of Government Ethics. Civil society organizations have also published several reports on the state of transparency and combating corruption in El Salvador. Finally, in December 2019, the Communications Unit of the Court of Government Ethics carried out an internal survey among its staff to identify good practices and areas for improvement. That was the first time in 13 years that such an audit had been undertaken.

31. In Ghana, the performance of the Ghana Police Service, one of the main actors in the fight against corruption, is periodically monitored and reviewed by the Minister of Interior through quarterly, bi-annually and annually reports. These periodic reports are complemented by the performance reviews carried out at the Ministry of Interior annual and mid-year review meetings. The National Development Planning Commission also reviews the performance of the Service and publishes its findings and comments in its annual progress reports which are accessible from its websites.

32. In Senegal, the National Office against fraud and corruption is subject to a yearly external audit by an accountancy firm.

## **6. Internal procedures and controls**

33. In Qatar, the Administrative Control and Transparency Authority is required by law to keep special records of its accounts. Each head of department must submit quarterly financial reports to the President of the Authority. The Authority is also subject to an external audit.

34. In Ukraine, an internal control and prevention corruption unit has been created within the National Agency on Corruption Prevention and a verification process of

the integrity of the staff has been developed. The Agency is also audited by an external evaluator every two years. The first evaluation is planned to take place in early 2022.

## **7. Whistle-blower protection**

35. In Armenia, the law on whistle-blower protection allows whistle-blowers to report information on corruption through an online platform, anonymously or with protection of the whistle-blower's identity, including through technology coding the IP address.

36. In El Salvador, allegations can be reported in various ways. A whistle-blower form is available online and procedures exist to protect the identity of the reporting persons. Moreover, a smartphone application has been developed and a dedicated online platform exist, both allowing for anonymous reporting.

37. In Mexico, the Secretariat of Public Service has developed an alert system, which functions as a platform for citizens and public servants to report acts of corruption and other serious forms of prohibited conduct by federal public servants. This online portal guarantees anonymity and confidentiality.

38. In Ukraine, the National Agency on Corruption Prevention has developed campaigns to raise awareness on whistle-blower mechanisms and protection guarantees, including by publishing information and infographics on its website.

## **8. Communication and public engagement**

39. In Armenia, the Corruption Prevention Commission holds sittings in open format with media representatives covering the sessions by live broadcasting. Its decisions are published on its website and on social media. The Commission also publishes a list of officials who did not submit their asset, income and interests declarations within the deadlines prescribed by law. The website of the Prosecutor's Office includes an anti-corruption section with relevant information on treaties, laws, decrees and orders of the Prosecutor General, as well as statements regarding the results of corruption investigations, and cooperation with international partners and civil society.

40. In Ecuador, the Judicial Council has developed a webpage to raise awareness and inform citizens on the prevention and fight against corruption.

41. In El Salvador, the Court of Government Ethics has organized awareness-raising campaigns using diverse communication channels, including social media accounts. Furthermore, it developed materials to disseminate information on its role, the law on government ethics, and unethical practices. It also encouraged the reporting of acts of corruption. Educational materials on ethics specifically aimed at children and the youth have also been disseminated. The Court also publishes quarterly a magazine in both physical and electronic formats, which counts 12 issues as of now.

42. In Qatar, the Administrative Control and Transparency Authority has launched a website to develop communication with the public and receive contributions and suggestions from individuals.

43. In Senegal, the National Office against fraud and corruption has created a complaint department tasked to receive and handle allegations of corruption.

44. In the State of Palestine, the Anti-Corruption Commission conducted a set of awareness-raising workshops on corruption, its dangers and ways to prevent it. The workshops targeted all groups of society, school and university students, women's institutions, public employees, civil society organizations, members of local councils and staff of security services.

45. In Ukraine, the National Agency on Corruption Prevention has the right to create commissions and working groups, to organize conferences, seminars and meetings on preventing and countering corruption. In 2019, the Agency organized training on various topics, including on corruption risk assessments for several public entities. It

also published recommendations and explanatory materials in order to assist persons requested to fill out declarations for State registers.

## **9. Technology**

46. In Armenia, a unified electronic register of licences has been instituted as a platform for issuing licences, making it easier for citizens to obtain such services and reducing corruption risks. The Corruption Prevention Commission has also initiated a modernization of the electronic declaration system, which intends to make the declaration process more efficient. The Commission intends to operate the updated platform from early 2021.

47. In Ecuador, the website of the Judicial Council includes an online platform to report allegations of corruption.

48. In El Salvador, the Court of Government Ethics has created and manages official accounts on social networks to raise awareness of the prevention of corruption, inform the public of sanctions imposed, as well as statistical data. In addition, a smartphone application has been launched to allow users to report corruption to the Court in an easy and fast manner.

49. In Mexico, the Executive Secretariat of the National Anti-Corruption System works in coordination with the Secretariat of Public Service in the design and implementation of a national digital platform. The platform connects the various electronic systems that contain data relevant to the fight against corruption, such as asset declarations, public procurements and public denunciations.

50. In Qatar, the Administrative Control and Transparency Authority has launched a website to enhance communication with the public. Other relevant initiatives include the “Qatar Open Data Portal” which allows the Government to publish government data.

51. In Ukraine, the National Agency on Corruption Prevention has been granted the right of direct automated access to all necessary State-owned registers and databases. Besides, it has created free online training courses, including on conflicts of interests, attended so far by more than 30,000 trainees.

## **10. Client orientation**

52. In Ecuador, the Judicial Council has created protocols for managing public information and requests for access to public information.

53. In Ukraine, the National Agency on Corruption Prevention held a public discussion in 2017 to discuss the draft Anti-Corruption Strategy 2018–2020 with representatives of civil society.

## **11. Enabling environment**

54. In El Salvador, the Court of Government Ethics has provided specialized training to its members, ethics commissioners and public servants, with special emphasis on those who work as teachers at different educational levels.

55. In Mexico, the Secretariat of Public Service is developing a network of “social comptrollers”, to observe and supervise public procurements.

56. In Ukraine, the National Agency on Corruption Prevention has held joint briefings and press conferences with the National Council on Television and Radio Broadcasting of Ukraine and the Central Election Commission. Such joint briefings aimed at the prevention of non-transparent funding of political parties during election campaigns.

## B. Performance indicators

57. In El Salvador, the annual report published by the Court of Government Ethics contains statistical data on the number of corruption reports and the number of settled cases since 2015.

58. In Ghana, the indicators used for reviewing the performance of the Ghana Police Service include police response time and average time taken to investigate complaints against the police. Additionally, as an implementation partner under the National Anti-Corruption Action Plan, the performance of the Ghana Police Service is periodically reviewed using indicators such as budgetary allocation, staff training, implementation of audit recommendations, number of complaints, investigations and sanctions.

59. In the Russian Federation, the Office of the Public Prosecutor's performance in fighting corruption is assessed through the statistics provided on corruption cases. The Office also performs anti-corruption assessments on draft laws.

60. In Ukraine, the annual report prepared by the National Agency on Corruption Prevention must contain the Agency's indicators of its efficiency and results achieved. The report includes statistical data on the results of the Agency's activities, including data on identified violations of specific laws, allegations of administrative offences, ongoing processes, cases referred to law enforcement and other bodies for follow-up and the results of those referrals, in terms of disciplinary or judicial actions.

## C. Ways to assess effectiveness

61. States parties emphasized the same ways of assessing the effectiveness of their anti-corruption bodies as already reflected in the background paper [CAC/COSP/WG.4/2020/4](#).

### 1. Annual reports by anti-corruption bodies

62. In El Salvador, the Court of Government Ethics prepares an annual report, presented before the Legislative Assembly and published online. It contains information on the main activities of the Court and statistical data.

63. In Ghana, the Ghana Police Service, like all other implementing agencies under the National Anti-Corruption Action Plan, carries out programmes under the plan and reports to the Commission on Human Rights and Administrative Justice. Based on the reports submitted, the performance of the Service is reviewed at the meeting of the National Anti-Corruption Action Plan High-Level Implementation Committee.

64. In Senegal, the the National Office against Fraud and Corruption publishes an annual report on its prevention, investigation and capacity-building activities.

65. In Qatar, the Administrative Control and Transparency Authority must submit regular reports to the Emir, on the programmes, work progress and financial situation of the Authority. An accounting report for each financial year is also required.

66. In Mexico, the Secretariat of Public Service presented its first report in 2019. It highlights prevention activities in areas such as ethics and integrity in public service, internal control and control visits to agencies and entities, as well as improvements in the management of federal Government programmes.

67. In the State of Palestine, the Anti-Corruption Commission publishes annually an activity report that includes statistics on received complaints, their distribution in terms of sectors and types of corruption and the outcomes of such complaints, including statistics on cases referred to the public prosecution and the judiciary. The report includes also excerpts of the most important judgments issued annually by the Corruption Crimes Court. These reports are available online.

68. In Ukraine, the National Agency on Corruption Prevention is required to provide an annual assessment of the effectiveness of implementation of the principles of anti-corruption policies, to be reflected in its annual report. The annual report of the National Agency on Corruption Prevention is published online.

## **2. Oversight by legislative bodies**

69. In Ecuador, the Judicial Council submits an annual report to the National Assembly. It also participates to hearing before the judicial committee of the chamber, including on the evaluation process of judges.

70. In El Salvador, the Court of Government Ethics prepares an annual report, presented before the Legislative Assembly and published online. It contains information on the main activities of the Court and statistical data.

71. In Mexico, the Secretariat of Public Service submitted its first report to the Congress.

72. In Ukraine, the Parliament of Ukraine holds hearings on the state of corruption, and approves and publishes an annual report on implementation of anti-corruption policy grounds. Such hearings took place in 2016 and 2017, but not in 2018 and 2019.

## **3. National surveys**

73. In Ukraine, the National Agency on Corruption Prevention undertook in 2017 a survey of entrepreneurs, experts and population on “Corruption in Ukraine: Understanding, perception, prevalence” with the cooperation of an independent research company and a national institute. It allowed to identify trends and dynamics in corrupt practices and public assessment of anti-corruption activities.

## **4. International assessments**

74. In Ukraine, international organizations observed a fragmented approach and inefficiencies in the implementation of anti-corruption policy, due to a lack of an anti-corruption strategy in 2018 and 2019. As a response, a law was adopted to ensure the effectiveness of the institutional mechanism for the prevention of corruption, strengthening the National Agency on Corruption Prevention.

---